

UTM-JHI Annual Seminar Series

“Fragments of Latin poetry in Cicero”

Hannah Čulík-Baird, 23 Oct. 2019

culik@bu.edu; @opietasanimi

What we remember

1a. Nicholson Baker, *U and I* (1991), p37:

...when I finished the entire essay I assembled all my Updike books, and I took out from the library the ones I lacked, and I tried to locate each phrase I had used. In most cases I regretfully corrected my misquotations—regretfully because my errors of memory were themselves of mild scientific interest to me. A surprising number of phrases weren't where I remembered them as being—for example, I was sure that “vast dying sea,” which I encountered in 1982, was in “Who Made Yellow Roses Yellow,” but I finally found it in “Incest.” And I knew that his sentence about reading “what they told me” in college was in *Esquire's* 1989 summer reading issue—it isn't.

1b. Nicholson Baker, *U and I* (1991), p37:

Where my argument depends in some way on my misquotation, I have left the error intact and simply corrected myself between brackets: []. If the phrase was not to be found anywhere in a week of flipping and skimming, I resorted to “Updike says something like” and kindred fudgings to indicate that what I'm remembering is only a paraphrase, and may not even exist.

1c. Nicholson Baker, *U and I* (1991), p81:

...in one of his early poems he talks about the view from shipboard:

The blue below
Is Aquamarine
Sometimes the blue below
Is green

[The real lines, from “Shipbored,” are:

That line is the horizon line.
The blue above it is divine.
The blue below it is marine.
Sometimes the blue below is green.]

“Broken” things

2. Petrarch, *Fam.* 6.2:

et euntibus per moenia fractae urbis et illic sedentibus, ruinarum fragmenta sub oculis erant. quid ergo? multus de historiis sermo erat.

And as we walked around the walls of the broken city and sat there, the fragments of its ruins were before our eyes. So we spoke for a long time about its past.

3. Hans Ulrich Gumbrecht, *The Powers of Philology* (2003), 9-10:

One of the shorter entries in Walter Benjamin’s *One-Way Street* (*Einbahnstraße* [=1972: 123]) refers to a visual memory of the castle of Heidelberg. “HEIDELBERG CASTLE: Ruins whose debris point into the sky tend to look twice as beautiful on those clear days when the eye, through their windows or simply above them, meets the passing clouds. Through the mobile spectacle that it stages in the sky, their destruction confirms the eternity of these debris.” ...[p10] Quite irresistibly, the ruins of a building make us think of the building in the state of its no longer existing wholeness. And what kind of a lack does the spectacle of the passing clouds evoke? It is the frustration coming from a process that is nothing but a continuous emerging and continuous vanishing of forms, an ongoing transition in which these forms never gain any stability.

4. Maurice Blanchot, *The Writing of Disaster* (1995), translated by Ann Smock, p60:

The fragment, as fragments, tends to dissolve the totality which it presupposes and which it carries off toward the dissolution from which it does not (properly speaking) form, but to which it exposes itself in order, disappearing — and along with it, all identity — to maintain itself as the energy of disappearing

5. Gerda Lerner, *The Creation of Patriarchy* (1986), p15:

When Darwinian theory dominated historical thought, pre-history was seen as a “barbaric” stage in the evolutionary progress of humankind from the simpler to the more complex. That which succeeded and survived was by the very fact of its survival considered superior to that which vanished and had thus “failed.”

6a. Josephine Balmer, *The Paths of Survival* (2017), p11:

Proem: Final Sentence

(Sackler Library, Oxford, Present Day)

Still I am drawn to it like breath to glass
That ache of absence, wrench of nothingness,
stark lacunae we all must someday face.

I imagine its letters freshly seared;
a scribe sighing over ebbing taper,
impatient to earn night's coming pleasures
as light seeped out of Alexandria.

But in these hushed corners of Oxford
Library afternoons, milky with dust,
the air is weighted down by accruing loss

and this displaced scrap of frayed papyrus
whose mutilated words can just be read,
one final, half-sentence: *Into darkness...*
Prophetic. Patient. Hanging by a thread.

6b. Aeschylus' *Myrmidons* fr. 136 Sommerstein (2009), p146:

ATTRIBUTED FRAGMENTS

136

ΑΧΙΛΛΕΥΣ

μηρῶν τε τῶν σῶν ἠὺσέβησ' ὀμιλίαν
κλαίων

[Lucian], *Erotes* 54 (στένων . . . Ἀχιλλεὺς τὸν Πατρόκλου
θάνατον: author and play not specified)

1 ἠὺσέβησ' (εὐσέβησ') ὀμιλίαν Hermann: εὐσεβῆς (om.
L) ὀμιλία codd.

2 κλαίων Dobree: καλλίω codd.

The letters]ηρομιλ[in line 3 of a five-line scrap of papyrus (Oxyrhynchus Papyrus 2256 [= Aesch. fr. dub. 451s], frag. 55) have been identified by Snell and others as coming from line 1 of the above fragment. The scanty remains of the surrounding lines are not incompatible with this identification; if it is correct, line 2 of this fragment of Myrmidons may have ended [κατ]α σκότο[ν] "down in(to) the darkness".

6c. P. Oxy. 2256, fr. 55:



7a. Josephine Balmer, *The Paths of Survival* (2017), p18:

Papyrus Trace

(*Papyrological Institute, Florence, 1953*)

Among the professor's papers
deposited after her recent death —

calculations, petty cash registers,
even a house plan in faint sketch —

we found a pencilled transcript,
scrawled in haste, not remembered,

traced beneath an old shopping list,
a breath exhaled, deep-buried ember:

trapped in the scent of lavender, musk;
letters from a lost world, seeping back

to black, etched in breath-blown dust:
...speak out... ...dissent... ...enough...:

a few precious words of Aeschylus
we'd all believed had gone forever —

the fragment found at Oxyrhynchus
then lost again in an Allied raid

by this second miracle returned to us,
late violets trembling above a grave.

7b. Josephine Balmer, *The Paths of Survival* (2017), p87:

Medea Norsa (1877-1952) became director of the Papyrological Institute in Florence after the death of her predecessor Girolamo Vitelli in 1935, at a time when few women were classical scholars, let alone senior figures in the field. Her house was destroyed in an Allied raid on the city in 1944 which also killed her sister, with whom she lived. After her death in 1952, a transcript of a scrap of papyrus excavated at Oxyrhynchus [=PSI 1472], which contained incomplete lines from *Myrmidons* (and had been thought lost forever in the raid), was discovered among the Institute papers.

Cicero and the Poets

8a. Cicero, *De Senectute* 1; Ennius' *Annales*.¹

<i>O Tite, si quid ego adiuero curamue leuasso</i>	
<i>quae nunc te coquit et uersat in pectore fixa ecquid erit praemi?</i>	[Skutsch 337-339]
<i>licet enim mihi uersibus eisdem affari</i>	
<i>te Attice quibus affatur Flamininum</i>	
<i>ille uir haud magna cum re sed plenus fidei</i>	[Skutsch 335]
<i>quamquam certo scio non ut Flamininum</i>	
<i>sollicitari te, Tite, sic noctesque diesque</i>	[Skutsch 336]
<i>noui enim moderationem animi tui et aequitatem</i>	
<i>teque cognomen non solum Athenis deportasse,</i>	
<i>sed humanitatem et prudentiam intellego.</i>	

Goldberg-Manuwald translation (2018 Loeb):

*“Titus, if I should provide some aid or lighten the care
which, now fixed in your breast, sears and unsettles you,
will there be some reward?”*

For I may address you, Atticus, with those very lines with which Flamininus is addressed by

“that man of no great wealth but full of loyalty”

although certainly I understand that it is not, like Flamininus,

“that you, Titus, are thus tormented night and day”

for I know the control and balance of your mind, and I realize that you have brought back from Athens not only a cognomen but sensibility and discretion.

¹ cf. *Att.* 16.3.1, where Cicero refers to *De Senectute* as “*O Tite, si quid.*”

8b. Cicero, *Div. 1.40-41*; Ennius' *Annales*.

num te ad fabulas reuoco uel nostrorum uel Graecorum poetarum?

narrat enim et apud Ennium Vestalis illa:

et cita cum tremulis anus attulit artibus lumen,

[Skutsch 34-50]

talia tum memorat lacrimans, exterrita somno:

“Eurydica prognata, pater quam noster amauit,

uires uitaque corpus meum nunc deserit omne.

nam me uisus homo pulcer per amoena salicta

et ripas raptare locosque nouos. ita sola

postilla, germana soror, errare uidebar

tardaque uestigare et quaerere te neque posse

corde capessere: semita nulla pedem stabilibat.

[1.41] *exim compellare pater me uoce uidetur*

his uerbis: ‘o gnata, tibi sunt ante gerendae

aerumnae, post ex fluuio fortuna resistet.’

haec ecfatus pater, germana, repente recessit,

nec sese dedit in conspectum corde cupitus,

quamquam multa manus ad caeli caerula templa

tendebam lacrumans et blanda uoce vocabam.

uix aegro cum corde meo me somnus reliquit.”

haec, etiamsi ficta sunt a poeta, non absunt tamen a consuetudine somniorum.

Goldberg-Manuwald translation (2018 Loeb):

Need I recall for you the stories both our poets and the Greek poets tell? There’s also the famous Vestal in Ennius, who says:

“and quickly the old woman, with limbs atremble, brought a light.

Then, in tears, frightened out of sleep, she recounts these things:

“Daughter of Eurydice, whom our father loved,

strength and life now desert my entire body.

A handsome man seemed to take me through pleasant willows

and riverbanks and unfamiliar places. Then alone

awhile, sister true, I seemed to wander and

to track with slow foot and seek you but was unable

to embrace you [?]: no path supported my foot.

Then our father seemed to address me with his voice

in these words: ‘O child, you must bear great

sorrows before good fortune from the river will end them.’

So our father spoke, sister, and then quickly withdrew,

not putting himself in my sight, though my heart yearned for him

as I kept stretching my hands to the azure regions of the sky,

weeping and calling out with beseeching voice.

Sleep has only now left me, sick at heart.”

Though these are a poet’s imaginings, they are not far from the manner of dreams.

*Is this a fragment or not?**i) verse fragment or accidentally metrical prose?*

9a. Cicero, *De Oratore* 3.191:

neque uos paeān aut herous ille conturbet: ipsi occurrent orationi, ipsi inquam, se offerent et respondebunt non uocati.

Don't worry about the paeans or the dactyls: they will turn up in oratory of their own accord—yes, they will present themselves and appear without being summoned.

9b. Cicero, *De Natura Deorum* 2.25:

nam et lapidum conflictu atque tritu elici ignem uidemus et recenti fossione *terram fumare calentem*, atque...

We see fire struck by hitting or rubbing stones together and in a fresh ditch “*the earth steams with heat*,” and...

9c. ND 2.25 marked as a verse quotation of an unknown poet by Mayor (1883: 112):

terram fumare calentem: I have printed this as a verse quotation, because it does not seem to me at all likely that C. could inadvertently have fallen into the hexameter metre, as Sch. thinks. It is true there is nothing very noticeable in the line, but neither is there in § 151 *venas penitus abditas*, or III 37 *cur se sol referat nec longius progrediatur solstitiali orbi*, where see n. ; or *Tusc.* II 34 *ut multus e visceribus sanguis exeat*. For the use of *fumo* see *Lucr.* v 469 (at dawn) *tellus fumare videtur*; *Plin. N. H.* II 42 *humidum a terra, alias vero propter vapores fumidum, exhalari caliginem certum est*; *Aen.* XII 338 *equi fumantes sudore*. The evaporation

ii) *tangled up!*

10. A short quotation of Ennius' *Achilles* (*TrRF* II 1) which appears in the *Verrines* (2.1.46) can only be identified with the help of the scholia to Cicero:

10a. Cicero, *Verrines* 2.1.46; Ennius' *Achilles*.

tum subito tempestates coortae sunt maximae, iudices, ut non modo proficisci cum cuperet Dolabella non posset, sed uix in oppido consisteret; *ita magni fluctus eiciebantur* [*TrRF* II 1]. hic nauis illa praedonis istius, onusta signis religiosis, expulsa atque eiecta fluctu frangitur. in litore signa illa Apollinis reperiuntur; iussu Dolabella reponuntur. tempestas sedatur, Dolabella Delo proficiscitur.

Goldberg-Manuwald translation (2018 Loeb):

Then suddenly very severe tempests arose, judges, so that Dolabella not only was unable to set off, as he wished, but could hardly remain in town “*such great floods were being cast ashore.*” Here that ship of that thief, laden with religious statues, thrust out and cast ashore by the flood, is broken asunder; on the shore those statues of Apollo are found; on Dolabella's orders they are put back. The tempest subsides; Dolabella sets off from Delos.

10b. Scholia Gronoviana on Cic. *Verr.* 2.1.45, p344 Stangl:

ita magni fluctus eiciebantur. Enniano emistichio usus est ex ea tragoedia quae Achilles inscribitur.

Goldberg-Manuwald translation (2018 Loeb):

“*such great floods were being cast ashore*”: He has used an Ennian half-line from the tragedy that is entitled *Achilles*.

11. A passage of Ennius' *Annales* (Skutsch 247-9, 252-3) partially embedded in the *Pro Murena* (30) is so thoroughly integrated into the prose that it would be impossible to find unless Cicero had also quoted from it in two of his letters (*Fam.* 7.13.2, *Att.* 15). Some verses are so thoroughly embedded into Ciceronian prose that we do not know where one begins and the other ends; e.g. *Div.* 1.132 = Ennius' *Telamo*, *TrRF* II 117b.²

² cf. Jocelyn 1967: 358; and Carson 1992: 111 on entanglement of Simonides in Plato's *Protagoras*.

iii) *deliberately truncated*

12. Cicero will often give only a partial quotation and expect his audience to fill in the rest:

12a. Cicero, *Pro Plancio* 59; Accius' *Atreus*.

haec illi soleo praecipere (quamquam ad praecepta aetas non est grauis) quae ille a Ioue ortus suis praecipit filiis: *uigilandum est semper: multae insidiae sunt bonis*; [Dangel 45] *id quod multi inuideant...* [Dangel 62] *nostis cetera*.

I regularly teach him (even though he is not quite old enough for these lessons) what the man sprung from Jupiter teaches his own sons: “Always be alert: many traps are set for good men”; “what many men envy...” You know the rest.

12b. Cicero, *Pro Sestio* 102-103; Accius' *Atreus*.

pericula magna, fateor, *multae insidiae sunt bonis* [Dangel 45] uerissime dictum est; sed te *id quod multi inuideant multique expetant, inscitia est* [Dangel 62] inquit, *postulare, nisi laborem summa cum cura efferas* [Dangel 63]. nollem idem alio loco dixisset, quod exciperent improbi ciues: *oderint, dum metuant* [Dangel 47]. *praeclara enim illa praecepta dederat iuuentuti*.

The dangers are great, I confess it. “*Many traps are set for good men*” - is most truly said. But “*it is foolish,*” for you, “*to desire what many men envy, and many themselves seek,*” as he says, “*unless you summon the strength follow through with the greatest devotion.*” I would wish that the same man had, in a different place, not said the words which the worst men repeat: “*Let them hate, as long as they fear.*” For in those other words he had given excellent advice to the young.

12c. Cicero, *Orator* 164:

quare bonitate potius nostrorum uerborum utamur quam splendore Graecorum, nisi forte sic loqui paenitet: *qua tempestate Paris Helenam* [Unknown tragedy, *TrRF* I 26b] et quae sequuntur.

For which reason, let us use the goodness of our own words instead of the shine of Greek; unless, by chance, it bothers you to speak like this:

“At the time when Paris ... Helen ...”

12d. Cicero, *De Oratore* 3.219:³

aliud molestia – sine commiseratione graue quoddam et uno pressu ac sono obductum:

qua tempestate Helenam Paris innuptis iunxit nuptiis, [Unknown tragedy, *TrRF* I 26a]
ego tum grauida, expletis iam fui ad pariendum mensibus;
per idem tempus Polydorum Hecuba partu postremo parit.

Distress has another tone – without compassion, a heavy style, drawn out in one breath and note:

“At the time when Paris joined Helen in a marriage that was no marriage,
 I was then pregnant, the months were already passed; I was ready to give birth;
 At the same time, Hecuba gave birth to Polydorus, her last birth.”

³ This quotation appears as in a list of nine discrete verse citations at *De Or.* 3.217-219: Accius' *Atreus*, Dangel 58–59; Pacuvius' *Teucer*, Schierl fr. 243; Accius' *Atreus*, Dangel 64; Unknown tragedy, *TrRF* I, 25; Ennius' *Andromacha*, *TrRF* II, 23d; Ennius' *Alcmeo*, *TrRF* II, 12b; Accius' *Atreus*, Dangel 29–32; Unknown comedy, Ribbeck *inc. pall.* 32–34; Unknown tragedy, *TrRF* I, 26a. On this passage, see Čulík-Baird (forthcoming).

Whose work is this a fragment of?

13a. Cicero will sometimes name the poet/title...:

- **author, title, book number:**
 - *Brut.* 57-58: Q. Ennius...ex quo nulla suspicio est amicitiae causa esse mentitum. est igitur sic apud illum in nono ut opinor ‘Annali’
- **author, title:**
 - *ad Brut.* 1.2.3(2a.1): Plautinus pater in ‘Trinummo’
 - *TD* 3.65: quid ille Terentianus ipse se poeniens, id est, ἐαυτὸν τιμωρούμενος?
 - *Div.* 1.131: ille Pacuianus, qui in ‘Chryse’
- **author, named character:** *TD* 5.12.7: Hector ille Naeuianus; *TD* 1.107: uersibus apud Ennium Thyestes; *Fin.* 1.3: ut Terentianus Chremes; *Fam.* 7.33: ut ait Philoctetes apud Accium; *Div.* 1.40: apud Ennium Vestalis illa.
- **just author:** *Or.* 152: ut Naeuius; *TD* 3.63: apud Ennium; *TD* 2.48: Pacuius hoc melius quam Sophocles; *TD* 4.68: quem Caecilius; *TD* 2.13: falsumque illud Accii; *TD* 4.67: apud Trabeam; *TD* 4.55: dixit Afranius; *ND* 1.63: ut ait Lucilius.
- **just title:** *Fam.* 7.16.1: in ‘Equo Troiano’ scis esse in extremo; *Fam.* 9.22.1 ut ille in ‘Demiurgo’; *Or.* 155: in ‘Chryse’; *TD* 2.50: itaque in extremis ‘Niptris’; *TD* 4.72: qualis in ‘Leucadia’; *Fin.* 2.22: ex ‘Hymnide.’
- **just character:** *Fin.* 2.94: clamore Philocteteo; *TD* 3.39: aut Telamonem pulsum; *TD* 4.77: quid ait ex tragoedia princeps ille Argonautarum?; *TD* 5.108: Teucris uox accommodari potest; *Fam.* 6.6.6: ut in fabulis Amphiarus sic.

13b. ...but it is his regular practice not to:

- **‘poeta’:** *Mur.* 30: ut ait ingeniosus poeta; *Planc.* 59: scripsit grauis et ingeniosus poeta; *Scaur.* 3: ut ait poeta; *Rab. Post.* 28: ut ait poeta ille noster; *Phil.* 2.65: ut est apud poetam nescio quem; *Phil.* 13.49: ut ait poeta nescio quis; *De Or.* 1.198: appellatus a summo poeta; *De Or.* 2.187: quae recte a bono poeta dicta est; *De Leg.* 1.33 ut ait poeta.
 - we know that some of these are referring to very famous *poetae* indeed: e.g. *De Leg.* 1.33: humani, ut ait poeta, nihil a se alienum putarent = Terence *Heauton.* 77 (cf. *Off.* 1.30)
- **‘illud’:** *Fin.* 2.71: nosti, credo, illud; *De Or.* 3.166: atque illud; *ND* 3.10: ex hoc illud etiam; *TD* 5.52: praeceptum illud Atrei.
 - *illud* can regularly appear with name of poet, so the illuds that don’t have a name may actually be even more famous: *Fam.* 9.21: illud a Trabea; *TD* 2.13: illud Accii; *TD* 3.56: Caecilianum illud.
- **‘uersus’:** *Or.* 147: peruolgatissimus ille uersus qui; *Or.* 163: illuminatus est uersus.
- **song:** *Fam.* 9.22.1: nosti canticum; *TD* 3.46: praeclarum carmen!...uerbis et modis lugubre.
- **genre:** *Fam.* 9.22.1: itaque non modo in comoediis...sed etiam in tragoediis; *TD* 4.69: de comoedia loquor...quid ait ex tragoedia?
- **metre:** *Fin.* 2.18: reliquique Graeci qui hoc anapaesto citantur; *TD* 3.57: nec siletur illud potentissimi regis anapaestum; *De Or.* 3.183: par fere Cretico.

Select Bibliography

Link to slides: <https://opietasanimiblog.files.wordpress.com/2019/10/culik-baird-toronto-october-23-2019-.pdf>

- Baker, N. 1991. *U and I*. New York: Random House.
- Balmer, J. 2017. *The Paths of Survival*. Bristol: Shearsman Books.
- Blanchot, M. 1995. *The Writing of Disaster*. Translated by A. Smock. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press.
- Carson, A. 1992. "How Not to Read a Poem: Unmixing Simonides from *Protagoras*," *Classical Philology*, Vol. 87, No. 2. 110-130.
- Čulík-Baird, H. Forthcoming. "Fragments of 'anonymous' Latin verse in Cicero," in B. Kayachev (ed.), *Poems without poets: approaches to anonymous ancient poetry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Elliott, J. 2013. *Ennius and the architecture of the Annales*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Goldberg, S. and Manuwald, G. 2018. *Fragmentary Republican Latin, Volume I: Ennius, Testimonia. Epic Fragments; Vol. II: Ennius, Dramatic Fragments, Minor Works*. Loeb Classical Library. Cambridge, MA; London: Harvard University Press.
- Gumbrecht, H. U. 2003. *The Powers of Philology*. Urbana, Chicago, and Springfield: University of Illinois Press.
- Jocelyn, H. D. 1967. *The Tragedies of Ennius*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lerner, G. 1986. *The Creation of Patriarchy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mayott, J. B. 1883. *M. Tulli Ciceronis, De Natura Deorum Libri Tres. Introduction and Commentary*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skutsch, O. 1985. *The Annals of Q. Ennius*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Zillinger, W. 1911. *Cicero und Die Altrömischen Dichter*. Staudenraus.